The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

An International Journal of Current Research and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

ISSN 0140-525X

Editor
Stevan Harnad
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08540

Assistant Editor
Helaine Randerson

Associate Editors
Behavioral Biology
Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/Universität Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior
Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence
Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development
Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Cognitive Neuroscience
Lynn Nadel/U. California, Irvine

Developmental Psychology
Charles J. Brainerd/U. Western Ontario

Evolutionary Biology
Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior
A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems
Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition
Peter Wason/University College, London

Language and Language Disorders
Max Coltheart/U. London

Neurobiology
Graham Hoyle/U. Oregon

Neuropharmacology
Susan D. Iversen/U. Cambridge

Neuropsychology
Jeffrey A. Gray/U. Oxford

Neurophysiology
Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology
Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Philosophy
Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts

Psychobiology
Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut
David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

Quantitative Methods
Donald B. Rubin/U. Wisconsin

Vision and Artificial Intelligence
Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Volume 6 1983

Cambridge University Press
Cambridge
London New York New Rochelle
Melbourne Sydney

Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP
32 East 57th Street, New York, NY 10022
296 Beaconsfield Parade, Middle Park, Melbourne 3206

We would like to acknowledge the first-rate contributions of the following copyeditors to the *BBS* editorial process: Barbara Westergaard and Mary Laing (1978–83) and Anne Hebenstreit (1980–83).

© Cambridge University Press 1983

Printed in the United States of America by Capital City Press, Montpelier, Vermont

Contents Volume 6 1983

Number 1, March 1983

Target Article

Haber, R.N. The impending demise of the icon: A critique of the concept of iconic storage in visual information processing 1

Open Peer Commentary

Adelson, E. H. What is iconic storage good for? 11
Allik, J. & Bachmann, T. How bad is the icon? 12
Banks, W. P. On the decay of the icon 14
Boynton, R. M. On "raw perception" of "the stimulus itself" 15
Breitmeyer, B. G. Icon as visual persistence: Alive and well 15
Bridgeman, B. & Mayer, M. Iconic storage and saccadic eye movements 16
Coltheart, M. Ecological necessity of iconic memory 17
Coren, S. Icons: To see or not to see 18
Di Lollo, V. Icons no, iconic memory yes 19
Finke, R. A. Apparent motion and the icon 20
Goldberg, M. E. Iconoclasm avoided: What the single neuron tells the psychologist about the icon 20
Hauske, G., Wolf, W. & Deubel, H. The dependence of perception on persisting images and "icons" 21
Holding, D. H. Distinguishing supraspan from subspan iconic storage 22
Johansson, G. Optic flow, icons, and memory 23
Jonides, J. Reports of the icon's impending demise are premature 24
Julesz, B. Textons, rapid focal attention shifts, and iconic memory 25
Loftus, G. R. The continuing persistence of the icon 28
Long, G. M. The icon as visual phenomenon and theoretical construct 28
Mace, W. M. & Turvey, M. T. The implications of occlusion for perceiving persistence 29
Massaro, D. W. Icons and iconoclasts 31
Mewhort, D. J. K. & Butler, B. E. On the nature of brief visual storage: There never was an icon 31
Meyer, G. E. Visual persistence: Just a flash in the scan? 33
Navon, D. The demise of the icon or of the icon-as-a-picture metaphor? 34
Neisser, U. The rise and fall of the sensory register 35
Phillips, W. A. Change perception needs sensory storage 35
Rayner, K. Icons, visual buffers, and eye movements 36
Sperling, G. Why we need iconic memory 37
Uttal, W. R. Don't exterminate perceptual fruit flies! 39
Vassilev, A. & Penchev, A. The sequential pickup of spatial information needs visual memory 40
Wasserman, G. S. Quantal basis of iconic dispersion 40
Wilson, J. T. L. A function for sensory storage: Perception of rapid change 42

Author's Response

Haber, R.N. The icon is finally dead 43

Target Article

Dretske, F. I. Précis of *Knowledge and the Flow of Information* 55

Open Peer Commentary

Alston, W. P. Dretske on knowledge 63
Arbib, M. A. Knowledge is mutable 64
Armstrong, D. M. Indeterminism, proximal stimuli, and perception 64
Barwise, J. Information and semantics 65
Bogdan, R. J. Determining what is perceived 66
Churchland, P. M. & Churchland, P. S. Content: Semantic and information–theoretic 67
Cummins, R. Information and cognitive agents 68
Ginet, C. Four difficulties with Dretske's theory of knowledge 69
Good, I. J. Physical probability, surprise, and certainty 70
Haber, R. N. Can information be objectivized? 70
Harman, G. Knowledge and the relativity of information 72
Kyburg, H. E. Jr. Knowledge and the absolute 72
Lehrer, K. & Cohen, S. Dretske on knowledge 73
Levi, I. Information and error 74
Loewer, B. Information and belief 75
Rozeboom, W. W. Can information be de-cognitized? 76
Rundle, B. The sufficiency of information-caused belief for knowledge 78
Sayre, K. M. Some untoward consequences of Dretske's "causal theory" of information 78
Sosa, E. On the "content" and "relevance" of information-theoretic epistemology 79
Suppes, P. Probability and information 81

Author's Response

Dretske, F. I. Why information? 82

Target Article

van den Berghe, P. L. Human inbreeding avoidance: Culture in nature 91

Open Peer Commentary

Bateson, P. Uncritical periods and insensitive sociobiology 102
Bittles, A. H. The intensity of human inbreeding depression 103
Bixler, R. H. Hypotheses are like people – some fit, some unfit 104
Daly, M. & Wilson, M. Explaining inbreeding avoidance requires more complex models 105
Dawkins, R. Opportunity costs of inbreeding 105
Demarest, W. J. Does familiarity necessarily lead to erotic indifference and incest avoidance because inbreeding lowers reproductive fitness? 106
Freedman, D. G. Preculture versus culture? 107
Irons, W. Incest avoidance: Shall we drop the genetic leash? 108
Lamb, M. E. & Charnov, E. L. A case for less selfing and more outbreeding in reviewing the literature 109
Lancaster, C. S. Sexual rivalry in human inbreeding or adaptive cooperation? 109
Livingstone, F. B. Do humans maximize their inclusive fitness? 110
Lumsden, C. J. The incestuous mind 112
Meiselman, K. C. A psychologist's perspective on incest avoidance behavior 112
Melotti, U. Inbreeding, cousin marriage, and social solidarity 112
Ruse, M. Is van den Berghe in a new paradigm? 113
Shepher, J. A coup de grace to cultural relativism 114
Smith, P. K. What are the mechanisms of coevolution? 114
Tiger, L. Stability and variation in human evolution 115
Williams, G. C. Some questions on optimal inbreeding and biologically adaptive culture 116
Wilson, E. O. Culture analyzed in the mode of the natural sciences 116

Author's Response

van den Berghe, P. L. Incest, genes, and culture 117

Target Article

Premack, D. The codes of man and beasts 125

Open Peer Commentary

Anderson, J. R. Representation without process? 137
Baer, D. M. Can you decode a code? 138
Bennett, J. Intellectual codes 139
Bickerton, D. The last of Clever Hans? 141
Block, N. Resemblance and imaginal representation 142
Danto, A. C. Images, labels, concepts, and propositions: Some reservations regarding Premack's "abstract code" 143
Denenberg, V. H. Effects of language training: Some comparative considerations 144
Freyd, J. J. The mental representation of action 145
Haber, L. Language training versus training in relations 146
Haber, R. N. When is a picture worth so many words? 147
Hulse, S. H. Tags, alphabets, and the neglect of sound 148
Hutchinson, J. W. Codes, relations, and mappings 149
Karmiloff-Smith, A. A new abstract code or the new possibility of multiple codes? 149
Leiber, J. Why it is unsurprising that ape "language training" enhances "completing incomplete (external) representations of action" 151
Marschark, M. A code by any other name . . . 151
Miller, G. A. Cognition and comparative psychology 152
Millward, R. Needed: Some specifics for an imaginal code 153
Olton, D. S. The representational codes for "sameness" 154
Roberts, W. A. Doubts about the importance of language training and the abstract code 154
Roitblat, H. L. Does language training affect the code used by chimpanzees?: Some cautions and reservations 155
Walker, S. F. The pros and cons of having a word for it 156
Zentall, T. R. Abstract codes are not just for chimpanzees 157

Author's Response

Premack, D. The abstract code as a translation device 158

Continuing Commentary

On Lynch, J.C. (1980) The functional organization of posterior parietal association cortex. BBS 3(4):485–534.

Szentágothai, J. Cortical organization: A plea for better understanding, clearer definition, and more correct use of the term "column" 169

On Denenberg, V. H. (1981) Hemispheric laterality in animals and the effects of early experience. BBS 4(1):1–19.

Berlucchi, G. Two hemispheres but one brain 169
Dimond, S. J. The brain is not a simple seesaw 172
Flor-Henry, P. Psychopathological implications of hemispheric laterality studies in animals 173
Weinstein, S. Asymmetrical functioning of the human cerebral hemispheres 174

Author's Response

Denenberg, V. H. Micro and macro theories of the brain 174

On **Johnston, T. D.** (1981) Contrasting approaches to a theory of learning. BBS 4(1):125–173.

Campbell, D. T. The general algorithm for adaptation in learning, evolution, and perception 178
Fraser, A. S. & Fishbein, H. D. On measuring canalized behavior 179
Galef, B. G. Jr. Am I a closet general process learning theorist? 180
Michaels, C. F. & Turvey, M. T. From observation to principles of learning: A long and problematic route 181
Mueller, H. C. What will we gain from an ecological approach to learning? Another ethologist's view 182
Wasserman, E. A. Ecology and learning: Some historical and analytical perspectives 183

Author's Response
Johnston, T. D. The ecological approach revisited 184

Number 2, June 1983

Target Article

Ojemann, G. A. Brain organization for language from the perspective of electrical stimulation mapping 189

Open Peer Commentary

Boller, F. Phrenology, 1982: What does it tell the aphasiologist? 207
Brown, J. W. Stimulation maps from the standpoint of aphasia study 207
Buckingham, H. W. Jr. Neurolinguistic and philosophical implications of electrical stimulation mapping of the human brain 209
Calvin, W. H. Timing sequencers as a foundation for language 210
Churchland, P. S. Ojemann's data: Provocative but mysterious 211
Cooper, W. E. Brain cartography: Electrical stimulation of processing sites or transmission lines? 212
Frazier, L. Motor theory of speech perception or acoustic theory of speech production? 213
Kent, R. D. Windows to the brain: Functional impairment and the surgical field 214
Lehnert, W. G. Language: Where AI and the neurosciences aren't meeting 215
Liberman, A. M. What a perception–production link does for language 216
Marshall, J. C. A rose by any other name 216
Newman, J. D. On models, mechanisms and the evolution of human language 217
Studdert-Kennedy, M. Mapping speech: More analysis, less synthesis, please 218
Tallal, P. A precise timing mechanism may underlie a common speech perception and production area in the peri-Sylvian cortex of the dominant hemisphere 219
Wood, F. Cortical and thalamic representation of the episodic and semantic memory systems: Converging evidence from brain stimulation, local metabolic indicators, and human neuropsychology 220

Author's Response

Ojemann, G. A. Electrical stimulation and the neurobiology of language 221

Target Article

Kyburg, H. E., Jr. Rational belief 231

Open Peer Commentary

Adler, J. E. Human rationality: Essential conflicts, multiple ideals 245
Bar-Hillel, M. & Margalit, A. To err is human 246
Cohen, L. J. Belief, acceptance, and probability 248
Dorling, J. In philosophical defence of Bayesian rationality 249
Evans, J. St. B. T. Psychological objectives for logical theories 250
Harman, G. Logic and probability theory versus canons of rationality 251
Harper, W. L. Kyburg on practical certainty 251
Johnson-Laird, P. N. Which comes first: Logic or rationality? 252
Kahneman, D. Philosophical arguments, psychological experiments, and the problem of consistency 253
Levi, I. Conjunctive bliss 254
Lopes, L. L. Normative theories of rationality: Occam's razor, Procrustes' bed? 255
Miller, D. Contrapositivism; or, The only evidence worth paying for is contained in the negatives 256
Nisbett, R. E. & Thagard, P. Psychology, statistics, and analytical epistemology 257
Pollard, P. Confirming confirmation bias 258
Revlin, R. The logic is in the representation 259
Seidenfeld, T. Decisions with indeterminate probabilities 259
Spielman, S. Kyburg on ignoring base rates 261
Tweney, R. D., Doherty, M. E. & Mynatt, C. R. Psychology and the foundations of rational belief 262

Author's Response

Kyburg, H. E., Jr. The role of logic in reason, inference, and decision 263

Target Article

Prioleau, L., Murdock, M., & Brody, N. An analysis of psychotherapy versus placebo studies 275

Open Peer Commentary

Andrews, G. Psychotherapy outcome: A wider view leads to different conclusions 285
Cordray, D. S. & Bootzin, R. R. Placebo control conditions: Tests of theory or of effectiveness? 286
Dahl, H. Give choice a chance in psychotherapy research 287
Dawes, R. M. Trends based on cotton candy correlations 287
Eagle, M. N. Psychotherapy versus placebo: An end to polemics 288
Erwin, E. Psychotherapy, placebos, and wait-list controls 289
Eysenck, H. J. The effectiveness of psychotherapy: The specter at the feast 290
Fish, J. M. Enhancing the therapeutic respectability of placebos 291
Frank, J. D. The placebo is psychotherapy 291
Garfield, S. L. Does psychotherapy work? Yes, no, maybe 292
Glass, G. V, Smith, M. L. & Miller, T. I. Placebo effects in psychotherapy outcome research 293
Greenberg, R. P. Revisiting psychotherapy outcome: Promise and problems 294
Hedges, L. V. Statistical summaries in research integration 295
Kazdin, A. E. Meta-analysis of psychotherapy: Criteria for selecting investigations 296
Kline, P. Meta-analysis, measurement, and methodological problems in the study of psychotherapy 296
Maher, B. Meta-analysis: We need better analysis 297
Rosenthal, R. Improving meta-analytic procedures for assessing the effects of psychotherapy versus placebo 298
Rosenthal, T. L. Outcome research: Isn't sauce for the goose sauce for the gander? 299
Sebeok, T. A. Psychotherapy and placebo: "Sticks and stones will break my bones, but words can never harm me?" 300
Shapiro, D. A. Refinement, precision, and representativeness in meta-analysis 300
Shepherd, M. Psychotherapy outcome research and Parloff's pony 301
Spence, D. P. Therapeutic effectiveness: What domain is being studied? 302
Wilson, G. T. Limitations of meta-analysis and the lack of evidence that psychotherapy works 302

Author's Response

Brody, N. Where are the emperor's clothes? 303

Continuing Commentary

On **Jensen, A. R.** (1980) Précis of *Bias in Mental Testing.* BBS 3(3):325–371.

Schönemann, P. H. Do IQ tests really measure intelligence? 311

Author's Response

Jensen, A. R. The definition of intelligence and factor-score indeterminacy 313

On **Warren, R. M.** (1981) Measurement of sensory intensity. BBS 4(2):175–223.

Geissler, H.-G. Physical correlate theory versus the indirect calibration approach 316
Penchev, A., Kurtev, A. & Vassilev, A. The neurophysiological code and sensory magnitude 317

Author's Response

Warren, R. M. The calibration of sensory scales 319

On **Rachlin, H., Battalio, R., Kagel, J. & Green, L.** (1981) Maximization theory in behavioral psychology. BBS 4(3):371–417.

Catania, A. C. Is nonresponding behavior? 321
Gibbon, J. Maximizing the past minimizes the future 322
Heyman, G. M. A cross-situational test of utility theory 324
Hursh, S. R. Maximization and reinforcement theory compared 324
Lea, S. E. G. Substitutability, the form of indifference contours, and some pitfalls for a maximization paradigm 326
Schwartz, B. Behavior theory's econometric garb: The emperor's new clothes 327
Wong, P. T. P. Limitations of the economic animal 328

Authors' Response

Rachlin, H., Battalio, R., Kagel, J. & Green, L. The concept of leisure in maximization theory 330

On **Bernstein, I. S.** (1981) Dominance: The baby and the bathwater. BBS 4(3):419–457.

Barnett, S. A. Dominance: An empirical finding or a platonic idea? 334
Delgado, J. M. R. Dominance, hierarchy, and brain stimulation 334
McKenna, J. J. The dominance concept: We agree more than we realize 335
Rosenblum, L. A. & Schwartz, G. G. Dominance: Strategy is the name of the game 337
Ursin, H. and Myhre, G. Instrumental effects of agonistic behavior 338

Author's Response

Bernstein, I. S. Agreements on dominance! 338

On Colby, K. M. (1981) Modeling a paranoid mind. BBS 4(4):515–560.

Manschreck, T. C. Modeling a paranoid mind: A narrower interpretation of the results 340

Author's Response

Colby, K. M. Limits on the scope of PARRY as a model for paranoia 341

Number 3, September 1983

Target Article

Dennett, D. C. Intentional systems in cognitive ethology: The "Panglossian paradigm" defended 343

Open Peer Commentary

Beatty, J. Rationality: Putting the issue to the scientific community 355
Bennett, J. Cognitive ethology: Theory or poetry? 356
Churchland, P. S. Dennett's instrumentalism: A frog at the bottom of the mug 358
Danto, A. C. Science as an intentional system 359
Dawkins, R. Adaptationism was always predictive and needed no defense 360
Eldredge, N. A la recherche du docteur Pangloss 361
Ghiselin, M. T. Lloyd Morgan's canon in evolutionary context 362
Graham, G. Denoting and demoting intentional systems 363
Griffin, D. R. Thinking about animal thoughts 364
Harman, G. Adaptationist theorizing and intentional system theory 365
Heil, J. Belief ascription, parsimony, and rationality 365
Humphrey, N. The *adaptiveness* of *mentalism?* 366
Jolly, A. Dennett's "Panglossian paradigm" 366
Lewontin, R. C. Elementary errors about evolution 367
Lloyd, D. The scope and ingenuity of evolutionary systems 368
McFarland, D. Intentions as goals 369
Maynard Smith, J. Adaptation and satisficing 370
Menzel, E. W., Jr. Parlez-vous baboon, Bwana Sherlock? 371
Millikan, R. G. Dennett's rational animals: And how behaviorism overlooked them 372
Rachlin, H. The intentional stance faces backward 373
Ristau, C. A. Intentionalist plovers or just dumb birds? 373
Roitblat, H. L. Intentions and adaptations 375
Rosenberg, A. Content and consciousness versus the intentional stance 375
Seidenberg, M. S. Steps toward an ethological science 377
Skinner, B. F. A better way to deal with selection 377
Terrace, H. S. Nonhuman intentional systems 378

Author's Response

Dennett, D. C. Taking the intentional stance seriously 379

Target Article

Stabler, E. P., Jr. How are grammars represented? 391

Open Peer Commentary

Berwick, R. C. Using what you know: A computer-science perspective 402
Botha, R. P. On a computational perspective without substance 403
Davis, M. Church's thesis and representation of grammars 404
Demopoulos, W. & Matthews, R. J. On the hypothesis that grammars are mentally represented 405
Dennett, D. C. When do representations explain? 406
Gross, M. A few analogies with computing 407
Harman, G. Internally represented grammars 408
Harnish, R. M. Computational commitment and physical realization 408
Lipton, M. R. Levels of grammatic representation: A tempest in a teapot 409
Lockman, A. On speculating across opaque barriers 410
McCawley, J. D. Execute criminals, not rules of grammar 410
Marshall, J. C. How could you tell how grammars are represented? 411
May, R. Word processor or video game? 412
Morton, J. On levels 413
Roeper, T. The relevance of the machine metaphor 413
Samet, J. Grammars-as-programs versus grammars-as-data 414
Thompson, H. Computation misrepresented: The procedural/declarative controversy exhumed 415
Wilensky, R. Rules are not processes 415

Author's Response

Stabler, E. P., Jr. Computational theories and mental representation 416

Target Article

Campion, J., Latto, R. & Smith, Y. M. Is blindsight an effect of scattered light, spared cortex, and near-threshold vision? 423

Open Peer Commentary

Bach-y-Rita, P. Controlling variables eliminates hemianopsia rehabilitation results 448
Barbur, J. L. & Ruddock, K. H. The analysis of scattered light effects in hemianopic and normal vision 448
Bridgeman, B. Independent evidence for neural systems mediating blindsight 450
Clark, A. How to establish a difference in function 451
Cowey, A. On blind criticism 451
Economos, J. Direct awareness and inference 452
Haber, R. N. The two visual system hypothesis loses a supporter 453
Legg, C. R. Is subcortical vision necessarily mediated by the superior colliculus? 455
Meienberg, O. How can striate vision contribute to the detection of objects within a homonymous visual field defect? 455
Morton, A. Scotomas and the visual field 456
Pasik, P. & Pasik, T. Primate vision in the absence of geniculostriate system 457
Perenin, M. T. & Jeannerod, M. Are extrageniculostriate pathways nonfunctional in man? 458
Pöppel, E. Residual vision is an answer to what? 459
Puccetti, R. Blindsight: A simple explanation 460
Richards, W. Is hindsight better than blindsight? 461
Spehlmann, R. Blindness, visual cortex, and visually evoked potentials 461
Torjussen, T. & Magnussen, S. Blindsight: Not all unexpected findings are experimental artifacts 462
Underwood, G. Verbal reports and visual awareness 463
Weale, R. A. Blindsight–a nonproblem 464
Weiskrantz, L. Evidence and scotomata 464
Werth, R. Blindsight: Some conceptual considerations 467
Zihl, J. "Blindsight": Turning a blind eye? 468

Authors' Response

Campion, J., Latto, R. & Smith, Y. M. Structure, function, and consciousness in residual vision and blindsight 469

Continuing Commentary

On **Cohen, L. J.** (1981) Can human irrationality be experimentally demonstrated? BBS 4:317–370.

Adler, J. E. The rationality of the (lay) scientist: Toward reconciliation 487
Brilmayer, L. Discrepancies between human behavior and formal theories of rationality: The incompleteness of Bayesian probability logic 488
Cherniak, C. The epistemological status of lay intuition 489
Daniels, N. & Smith, G. E. The plasticity of human rationality 490
Dawes, R. M. Is irrationality systematic? 491
Gallois, A. & Siegal, M. Expert intuitions and the interpretation of social psychological experiments 492
Grandy, R. Intuition and inconsistency 494
Jepson, C., Krantz, D. H. & Nisbett, R. E. Inductive reasoning: Competence or skill? 494
Kahn, G. S. & Rips, L. J. Norms, competence, and the explanation of reasoning 501
Levi, I. Who commits the base rate fallacy? 502
Mynatt, C. R., Tweney, R. D. & Doherty, M. E. Can philosophy resolve empirical issues? 506
Revlin, R. Human inference: The notion of reasonable rationality 507
Shafer, G. A theory of probability should tutor our intuitions 508
Kahneman, D. & Tversky, A. Can irrationality be intelligently discussed? 509

Author's Response

Cohen, L. J. The controversy about irrationality 510

On **Bradshaw, J. & Nettleton, N. C.** (1981) The nature of hemispheric specialization in man. BBS 4:51–91.

Bogen, J. E. & Bogen, G. M. Hemispheric specialization and cerebral duality 517
Moscovitch, M. Local versus global solutions to problems of hemispheric specialization 520
Sergent, J. The analytic holistic dichotomy: An epiphenomenon 521
Zaidel, E. Advances and retreats in laterality research 523

Authors' Response

Bradshaw, J. L. & Nettleton, N. C. Hemispheric specialization: Return to a house divided 528

Number 4, December 1983

Target Article

Stone, E. A. Problems with current catecholamine hypotheses of antidepressant agents: Speculations leading to a new hypothesis 535

Open Peer Commentary

Akiskal, H. S. The need for primate models in the psychopharmacotherapy of depression 548
Anisman, H. & Zacharko, R. M. Cascading transmitter function in depression 548
Aprison, M. H. & Hingtgen, J. N. Postsynaptic serotonergic action of antidepressive drugs 549
Berrettini, W. H. Output hypothesis: Peering into the black box 551
Cohen, R. M. The dynamics of neurotransmitter regulation and antidepressant efficacy 551
Depue, R. A. Conceptual frameworks and biological psychopathology research 552
Essman, W. B. β-Adrenergic receptors and antidepressant action 553
Frazer, A. & Lucki, I. Is the "new" more useful than the "old"? 554
Huang, Y. H. An evaluation of the central concept in the output hypothesis for the mechanisms of action of antidepressant treatments 555
Katz, R. J. Stone's revised aminergic hypothesis and the functional significance of receptor binding sensitivity 555
Kraemer, G. W. The output hypothesis: New peripheral indicators of brain function? 556
Petty, F. Stress: Cause and cure of depression? 557
Roth, K. A. Epinephrine, the neglected catecholamine 557
Siever, L. J. Mode of action of antidepressant agents: Increased output or increased efficiency? 558
Smith, C. B. & Zelnik, T. C. Alpha-2 adrenergic receptors and the mechanism of action of antidepressants 559
Sugrue, M. F. Can a unitary hypothesis for depression be valid? 559
Vetulani, J. Alpha-1-up, beta-down hypothesis: A counterproposal to Stone 560

Author's Response

Stone, E. A. Input on output 561

Target Article

Wilensky, R. Story grammars versus story points 579

Open Peer Commentary

Abelson, R. P. Commentary points 591
Allen, J. F. Do story grammars and story points differ? 592
Bereiter, C. Story grammar as knowledge 593
Black, J. B. Are story representations good for anything? 594
Brewer, W. F. Form, content, and affect in the theory of stories 595
Britton, B. K. What makes stories interesting 596
Carr, T. H. Event structure, interest, importance, and coherence: Where does point theory fit? 597
van Dijk, T. A. A pointless approach to stories 598
Dyer, M. G. The point of thematic abstraction units 599
Graesser, A. C. How to develop a theory of story points 600
Keenan, J. M. & the Denver Discourse Group. The semantic-syntactic distinction in story grammars 601
Lehnert, W. G. Moving toward a point of some returns 602
Mandler, J. M. What a story is 603
Marshall, J. C. Wilensky's recipe for soap-opera scripts, or Marcel Proust is a yenta 604
Martin, M. Psychological considerations in story analysis 605
Parisi, D. Do points define stories or texts in general? 605
Perlis, D. Whose category error? 606
Pléh, C., László, J., Siklaki, I. & Terestyéni, T. What's the point in points without a grammar? 607
Sgall, P. A remark on stories, texts, and sentences 608
Small, S. L. The *story* in mind and in matter 609
Sperber, D. Twenty-four centuries of literary studies recapitulated in ten years of cognitive science: And now what? 610
Stein, N. L. What's the point? 611
Waltz, D. L. & Dorfman, M. H. The holes in points 612

Author's Response

Wilensky, R. Point: Counterpoint 613

Target Article

Grossberg, S. Quantized geometry of visual space: The coherent computation of depth, form, and lightness 625

Open Peer Commentary

Arend, L. E., Jr. "Filling-in" between edges 657
Bridgeman, B. Isomorphism is where you find it 658
Buffart, H. Functional and computational aspects of perception 659
Caelli, T. Universal coding and network structures for vision: Is Grossberg correct? 660
Coren, S. When "filling in" fails 661
Dalenoort, G. J. Grossberg's "cells" considered as cell assemblies 662
Foley, J. M. On psychophysical linking hypotheses, the direction of pattern induction, and the representation of distance and size 663
Foster, D. H. Experimental test of a network theory of vision 664

Freeman, W. J. Experimental demonstration of "shunting networks," the "sigmoid function," and "adaptive resonance" in the olfactory system 665
Grimson, W. E. L. To have your edge and fill-in too 666
Indow, T. Physiological models and geometry of visual space 667
Julesz, B. The role of analog models in our digital age 668
Laming, D. On the need for discipline in the construction of psychological theories 669
Levine, D. S. Toward a unified theory of visual perception 670
Poltrock, S. E. & Shaw, M. Failures of Grossberg's theory to compute depth, form, and lightness 671
Rosen, R. On nonquantum quantization 673
Savoy, R. L. Field of feature detectors or features detected by a field 673
Stevens, K. A. False dilemmas: Confusion between mechanism and computation 675
Wagner, M. Adaptive resonance theory: Problems with prediction 675

Author's Response
Grossberg, S. Interdisciplinary aspects of perceptual dynamics 676

Target Article

Dinsmoor, J. A. Observing and conditioned reinforcement 693

Open Peer Commentary

Badia, P. & Abbott, B. Observing and conditioned reinforcement: A case of selective observing? 704
Branch, M. N. Observing observing 705
D'Amato, M. R. Beyond Pavlovian and operant conditioning 705
Davis, H. Observing responses and the limits of animal learning theory 706
Fantino, E. Observing and the delay-reduction hypothesis 707
Hendry, D. P. Uncertainty, information, observing 708
Longstreth, L. E. Secondary reinforcement: Still alive? 709
Miller, R. R. The multiple determinants of observing behavior 710
Moore, J. Some observations on some observations about some observations 711
Nevin, J. A. Pavlovian contingencies and conditioned reinforcement 711
Perkins, C. C. Ways of observing conditioned reinforcement 712
Perone, M. & Baron, A. Can reinforcement by information be reconciled with a Pavlovian account of conditioned reinforcement? 713
Segal, E. F. Behavioral and cognitive psychology: Mixing the languages of input and output 714
Shull, R. L. Selective observing when the experimenter controls the duration of observing bouts 715
Terrace, H. S. A conditioned reinforcement theory of observing responses is not a refutation of cognitive psychology 716
Thompson, R. K. R. & Wilcox, S. Observing and information: Bad news is better than no news – but spare us the details 717

Author's Response
Dinsmoor, J. A. Some more information on observing and some more observations on information. 718

Continuing Commentary

On **Ullman, S.** (1980) Against direct perception. BBS 3(3):373–415.

Norman, J. Are the direct and indirect theories of perception incompatible? 729

On **Puccetti, R.** (1981) The case for mental duality: Evidence from split-brain data and other considerations. BBS 4(1):93–123.

Bradshaw, J. L. Mental duality, unity and multiplicity, and a holographic model of the mind 732
Harris, L. J. Henry Holland on the hypothesis of duality of mind 732
Rey, G. The lack of a case for mental duality 733
Wilson, D. L. A proposed experimental test of Puccetti's dual consciousness hypothesis 735

Author's Response
Puccetti, R. Holograms, history, mental agnosticism, and testability 735

On **Vanderwolf, C. H. and Robinson, T. E.** Reticulo-cortical activity and behavior: A critique of the arousal theory and a new synthesis. BBS 4(3):459–514.

Irmiš, F. Further complexities in the relation between Vanderwolf & Robinson's two behavioral types and EEG activity 740
Siegel, J. M. Reticular activity and arousal 741

Author's Reponse
Vanderwolf, C. H. Brain-behavioral studies: The importance of detailed observations of behavior 742

On **Le Magnen, J.** (1981) The metabolic basis of dual periodicity of feeding in rats. BBS 4(4):561–607.

Apfelbaum, M. & Mandenoff, A. The chronobiological pattern of opiate-related hyperphagia is different from the dual periodicity of monotonous food intake 744

Rolls, B. J., Rolls, E. T. & Rowe, E. A. Body fat control and obesity 744

Timo-Iaria, C. Metabolism and the triggering of feeding behavior 745

Author's Response

Le Magnen, J. Feeding studies versus eating studies 747

On Multiple Book Review of Gallistel's *The Organization of action: A new synthesis.* BBS 4(4):609–50.

Stein, J. Negative feedback or innate programmes? 749

Székely, G. Organized action and elementary units: Does recapitulating old ideas result in a new synthesis? 750

Author's Response

Gallistel, C. R. The importance of behavior in behavioral physiology 751